

PERSUASIVE ARGUMENT ANALYSIS AND CREDIBILITY EVALUATION

MUSIC TO WHOSE EARS?

Use the process we have practiced to analyze the text. Create two graphic organizers on pages 30 & 31.

Read the text. On page 30, identify what you consider to be some of most important quotes. Analyze and explain what the quotes tell us about the argument.

Then, identify the author's claim, at least 3 pieces of evidence the author offers to support their argument, and evaluate the credibility.

Music To Whose Ears?

Warm spring weather had finally arrived. I got in the passenger seat of my brother's car. He got in the driver's seat. We rolled down the windows, and he popped a CD in the stereo, turned up the volume, and headed out for the lake. This is a recipe for a great feeling and harmless fun, right? Some state senators do not think so. They have proposed a law that bans car speakers above a certain size and sets legal volume levels. This law is misguided and unfair. State government should not create a law to limit the noise levels coming from car stereos.

Some people may think that a law should be passed because they believe loud car stereos are a public nuisance – or even dangers. However, existing state laws already cover the problem of loud noises. According to Richard Tharpe, Hamilton County sheriff, "Right now we can arrest people for disturbing the peace, and state law even sets noise pollution levels. So a new law just doesn't seem necessary." In addition, if a stereo causes a traffic accident – which Tharpe notes is uncommon and hard to prove – the driver can be charged. However, in the past five years, only one such accident has been reported. To institute the proposed law, then, is simply unnecessary.

Another reason the legislature should vote down this proposal is that it will add to the burden of already overworked police. A number of towns and cities in the state have admitted to staffing shortages. In fact, Deputy Dennis Marquez, the father of a close friend, has had to work double shifts the last six months in order to ensure that all patrols are covered. According to Deputy Marquez, this shortage results from officers spending too much of their time enforcing misdemeanor laws similar to the proposed ban on loud car stereos. Just because serious crime is no longer on the rise, the police should not have to add another misdemeanor to their workload. Do they really have time to point decibel monitors at passing cars?

The most compelling reason to put a halt to this proposal is that setting legal limits on the volume of car stereos is a form of discrimination. After all, many other public noises are just as loud. Parades and rallies often use high-volume sound trucks. Radio stations broadcast live from stores and parking lots. Loudspeakers, marching bands, and cheering crowds at football games can be heard for blocks. For example, the cheering during last week's victorious game against the Tigers could be heard as far away as 135th Street. Also, what about the noise from tools? I have been awakened from a peaceful sleep on many Saturday mornings by neighbors' lawnmowers, yet I see no proposals for laws to regulate noise made under these circumstances. Why should car stereos be singled out?

We all want our streets to be calm and safe, but the senators' approach is misguided. An existing law already addresses the problem, and creating a new one would cause more work for police officers. In addition, the new law would not take into account other noises. A law restricting the volume of car stereos is unnecessary and unfair, and each of us should write or call our legislators to say so.

10/7 – Page 30 – Music to Whose Ears

Quotes	Analysis
“State government should not create a law to limit the volume of car stereos.	This is the author’s claim – what she wants people to do or agree with. She wants the senators to vote NO on the law, and the people to agree with her and help her persuade the Senators.
“Parades, rallies....radio stations....”	These are examples of other loud noises that no Senator wants to stop. It proves that it would be unfair or unethical to make a law about car stereos.
Sheriff Tharpe said, “right now we can arrest people for disturbing the peace...”	This is an expert opinion stating the fact that a law already exists.

10/7 – Page 31 - Credibility Evaluation

Claim
Evidence
Credibility Evaluation